

Professional Liaison Group for the review of the standards of education and training, 23 November 2015

Theme: Values in education

Executive summary and recommendations

### **Introduction**

The first phase of the standards of education and training (SETs) review has comprised a range of research and engagement activities to gather the views of stakeholders on the existing standards and accompanying guidance. This feedback has been synthesised into a number of key themes.

This paper focuses on the role of values in education and training, and includes consideration of values-based recruitment.

### **Decision**

The PLG is invited to discuss this paper and to consider the Executive's recommendations in sections 6 and further questions in section 7.

### **Background information**

See paper.

The current versions of the SETs and supporting guidance have been supplied separately as documents to note.

### **Resource implications**

None

### **Financial implications**

None

### **Appendices**

Appendix 1: Values in education – Other regulatory standards

### **Date of paper**

11 November 2015

---

## Theme: Values in education

### 1. Introduction

- 1.1 This paper explores the theme of values in education, drawing on feedback from stakeholders. Based on the prevalence of this topic in the first phase of the review, we consider that it warrants a specific discussion among PLG members.
- 1.2 In addition to the more general topic of the role that values play in education programmes, we have included as part of this theme considerations about admissions (recruitment) processes which are linked to values, because these issues were commonly raised by stakeholders in conjunction with each other.
- 1.3 There is unavoidably some overlap between stakeholder comments about values and comments on the link between the SETs and standards of conduct, performance and ethics (SCPE), a theme which has been presented in separate papers. However we have endeavoured to remove duplication as much as possible.
- 1.4 This paper provides background information and a summary of stakeholder feedback on this theme. The final sections set out recommendations from the Executive and some key points for the PLG to consider.

### 2. Background

- 2.1 The term 'values' is loosely defined and has been used in slightly different ways by different stakeholders. However usage indicates that stakeholders generally understand this to mean something different from ethics and conduct (although these topics are closely related). Rather the term 'values' is often used to refer to something more intrinsic to an individual such as their personality traits, attributes and attitudes which can shape their interaction with other people. Many conversations about values included mention of the need for health and care professionals to be 'caring' and 'compassionate' and to be 'committed' to being a health or care professional.
- 2.2 In the wake of the Francis report on the widespread failings at Mid Staffordshire Foundation Trust<sup>1</sup>, the Keogh report on quality of care<sup>2</sup>, the Berwick report on improving patient safety<sup>3</sup> and others, the topic of values possessed by individual health and care professionals – and how these impact on the quality of care given – has been widely contemplated and

---

<sup>1</sup> See [https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\\_data/file/279124/0947.pdf](https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/279124/0947.pdf)

<sup>2</sup> See <http://www.nhs.uk/nhsengland/bruce-keogh-review/documents/outcomes/keogh-review-final-report.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> See <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/berwick-review-into-patient-safety>

discussed. In many cases there is an emphasis on the importance of getting the 'right' people into health and care professions in the first place. This indicates a strong sense among many educators, professionals and policymakers that there is a need to include values as an integral part of recruitment and assessment of students on health and social care education programmes.

### **Values-based recruitment**

- 2.3 Between 2013 and 2015, Health Education England (HEE) undertook a programme of work to develop and implement a national values-based recruitment framework. HEE defined values-based recruitment as 'an approach which attracts and recruits students, trainees and employees on the basis that their individual values and behaviours align with the values of the NHS Constitution'. The aim of this work was to ensure that by March 2015, all students recruited to NHS-funded training programmes (in England) are recruited for the values of the NHS Constitution. The development of a workforce with the right values is seen as necessary to support effective team working in delivering excellent patient care and experience.<sup>4</sup>
- 2.4 In contrast, there is a view held by some that values, beliefs and personal attributes can be taught and enhanced through education, rather than needing to be pre-existing. In 2011, the qualitative study 'Professionalism in healthcare professionals', which was commissioned by the HCPC from Durham University, looked at how professionalism was perceived by students and educators across three regulated professions (chiropractors / podiatrists, occupational therapists and paramedics). The report found that many educators also saw the need to develop and bring out the best of students as an important part of their role, meaning they needed to engage with values, beliefs and attributes as things that can be taught or at least improved in an educational setting.
- 2.5 This paper does not attempt to answer the question of whether values can or should be taught through education and training, or whether they need to be intrinsic to an individual. Instead it considers feedback from stakeholders on the importance of, as well as challenges in, integrating values in recruitment processes and throughout education and training.

### **3. Current approach**

- 3.1 The SETs do not currently require any form of values-based recruitment process. However, one standard in SET 2 on admissions does set a requirement for criminal convictions checks as a part of admissions procedures:
- '2.3 The admissions procedures must apply selection and entry criteria, including criminal convictions checks.'

---

<sup>4</sup> More information on the HEE programme on VBR can be found on their website: <http://hee.nhs.uk/work-programmes/values-based-recruitment/>

- 3.2 The guidance underneath SET 2.3 provides advice on what the education provider might find it helpful to take into account when considering an application from someone who has a criminal conviction.
- 3.3 In addition we produce ‘Guidance on health and character’<sup>5</sup> to provide information on our processes when assessing the health and character of people who apply to, or who are on, our Register. This document includes a section aimed at education providers, particularly if they are advising applicants who have declared convictions.
- 3.4 One standard in SET 6 on assessment is also relevant to the topic of values: ‘6.3 Professional aspects of practice must be integral to the assessment procedures in both the education setting and practice placement setting.’
- 3.5 The guidance under SET 6.3 states that “Professional aspects of practice” may include, for example, the students familiarity with: independence and the need to be able to justify their actions; values and ethics; or their understanding of the nature of professional regulation, and the responsibilities this involves.’

#### **4. Summary of stakeholder feedback**

- 4.1 Discussions with stakeholders during the first phase of the SETs review drew out a number of comments relating to values in education, and in particular the role of values in the admissions process. This feedback is further detailed below. In order to assist the PLG in considering the various aspects of this theme, comments on similar issues have been grouped under subheadings.

#### **Integrating values in education**

- 4.2 Visitors attending refresher training emphasised the importance of ethics, values and integration of law in education. While these were perhaps most important in the context of practice placements, visitors emphasised that values and aspects of professionalism needed to permeate across all aspects of the programme, not just placements.
- 4.3 Service users and carers involved in the review were particularly animated about the importance of values and attributes in a student’s or a professional’s fitness to practise. Those characteristics most commonly mentioned include respect, non-judgement, compassion, and treating people with dignity and as individuals.
- 4.4 Some attendees at service user and carer workshops commented that students were often unsure about professional boundaries and whether they were allowed to be emotionally connected to a service user (for example, when someone dies). However, it was felt that being emotionally present was

---

<sup>5</sup> Guidance on health and character is available on the HCPC website: <http://www.hcpc-uk.org/publications/brochures/index.asp?id=220>

an important attribute for a student to be able to treat people with dignity and as individuals.

- 4.5 There were some split opinions among service users and carers about whether people are innately 'caring' as part of their personality or whether it can be taught or built upon. However it was suggested that education programmes could show students examples of 'good' and 'bad' behaviour by professions, for example through case studies, as a way of attempting to teach about values.
- 4.6 Members of the NHS Education for Scotland (NES) AHP Advisory Group thought that the importance of empathy and compassion in practice needed to be articulated more in the SETs, particularly in light of Francis enquiry. In particular, they thought that requirements relating values and professionalism could be strengthened within the practice placement standards, including around personal conflict, attitudes and behaviour. Some also suggested that the preface to the standards could be used to set some context relating to values and behaviour.
- 4.7 Some specific suggestions from the NES AHP Advisory Group include the following:
  - SET 4.5 guidance should clearly reflect values-based education; at the moment it does not indicate how much emphasis should be placed on values during the programme.
  - SET 4.6 should refer to values-based reflective practice.

### **Values-based recruitment**

- 4.8 Professional bodies represented at the AHP Education Leads meeting were in favour of more focus on professional suitability within the SETs, as well as stronger emphasis on recruitment based on an applicant's demonstrable values and commitment to becoming a health or social care professional. They stated that there should be appropriate measures in place within education and training programmes to gauge applicants' care experience, the learning they have derived from it and their capacity for compassionate care.
- 4.9 Similarly, in reflecting on how best to embed the SCPE within approved education and training, members at the Council of Deans Summit, thought that values-based recruitment would be a way to do so from the very start of a programme.
- 4.10 Service users and carers agreed on the importance of education providers recruiting the 'right' people onto programmes in the first place. One attendee at a service user and carer workshop commented that students who are chosen on the basis of academic criteria can be very good academically, but then when they go on placement it turns out that they are not suitable because of their attitudes or personal attributes.

- 4.11 On the other hand, some stakeholders have expressed caution about the potential inclusion of a requirement for values-based recruitment. Some attendees at the April 2014 Education Stakeholder Event raised a number of concerns over the poor evidence base for the effectiveness of values-based recruitment; as well as the dangers of too much focus on the characteristics of an individual at the point of applying to a programme, where this means that not enough attention is paid to what happens to them on the programme.
- 4.12 Other concerns expressed were that regulators were being pressured into taking a stance on values-based recruitment because of a 'short term political agenda', and that the HCPC should consider very carefully whether to support this principle before making a decision to integrate it in the SETs.
- 4.13 Many of the stakeholders who expressed these concerns were of the opinion that values were best reflected as a required output from approved programmes and could be best captured in the standards of proficiency or the SCPE, rather than included as a prescriptive element within the admissions standards (or elsewhere) in the SETs.
- 4.14 Some service users and carers commented that it can be difficult to assess someone's values when they are very young and have not yet begun their professional lives, because it is possible that their values have not been fully developed yet. There was a concern that with values-based recruitment, where the assumption is that values cannot be taught, would have the potential of eliminating applicants who could be very well suited to a profession but simply need the 'caring' part of their personality to be further developed.

## **5. Other regulatory standards**

- 5.1 Other health and social care regulators in the UK take a variety of different approaches to setting standards relating to integrating values in education and values-based recruitment. Some brief observations are provided below, while the table at Appendix 1 provides further detail about the approach taken by each regulator.
- 5.2 A number of other health and social care regulators do include reference to personal and professional values in standards for education providers and/or as part of the competencies which students must obtain through education and training. Some of these references are fairly general and linked to the relevant standards on conduct and ethics or codes of practice. Others, like the Nursing and Midwifery Council's (NMC) education standards specifically mention the importance of compassionate, sensitive, person-centred care, which maintains respect and dignity.
- 5.3 A few regulators, however, do not mention values at all in their education standards.
- 5.4 None of the other regulators require values-based recruitment as part of their education standards, but some do require education providers to check that

applicants are of 'good character', the focus being on criminal conviction and caution checks.

## 6. Executive recommendations

- 6.1 The Executive is not recommending any specific amendment to the SETs or supporting guidance with the objective of increasing the focus on values.
- 6.2 We are not satisfied that the term 'values' is well enough defined to incorporate within standards. The attributes, attitudes and personality traits which were highlighted as most important during the review varied among stakeholder groups.
- 6.3 Furthermore, we consider that many of the values highlighted by stakeholders are already covered by the generic standards of proficiency (SOPs) and the SCPE. The generic SOPs state, for instance:
- '2 Be able to practise within the legal and ethical boundaries of their profession'
  - '5 Be aware of the impact of culture, equality and diversity on practice'
  - '6 Be able to practise in a non-discriminatory manner.'
- 6.4 The revised SCPE<sup>6</sup> (which have recently been ratified by the Council) state:
- '1.1 You must treat service users and carers as individuals, respecting their privacy and dignity.
  - '1.2 You must work in partnership with service users and carers, where appropriate, involving them in decisions about the care, treatment or other services to be provided.
  - '1.3 You must empower service users, where appropriate, to maintain their own health and wellbeing and support them to make informed decisions. [...]
  - '1.5 You must not discriminate against service users, carers and colleagues by allowing your personal views to affect your professional relationships or the care, treatment or other services that you provide.
  - '1.6 You must challenge colleagues if they demonstrate discriminatory attitudes or behaviours.' [...]
  - '2.1 You must be polite and considerate.
  - '2.2 You must listen to service users and carers and take account of their needs and wishes.'
- 6.5 Likewise, The Executive does not recommend the addition of a requirement for values-based recruitment in the SETs.
- 6.6 We agree with stakeholders about the importance of compassionate, caring and person-centred health and care services. However, we have not set out

---

<sup>6</sup> <http://www.hcpc-uk.org/assets/documents/10004D38Enc06-OutcomesoftheconsultationonSCPE.pdf>

to determine whether there are specific personal values and attributes necessary for health and care professionals to practice in such a way; and if so, whether these are intrinsic to an individual or can be taught through education and training. This is likely to remain the subject of research and debate indefinitely.

- 6.7 Discussion around values-based recruitment is necessarily focused on inputs, that is, the values possessed by an individual at the start of an education programme. The SETs, however, are intended as outcome-focused standards. Their purpose is to ensure that students completing approved education and training programmes are fit to practise, meaning that they meet the standards of proficiency (SOPs) for safe and effective practice in their profession and are able to meet the SCPE when they apply for registration.
- 6.8 The SOPs and SCPE are themselves also focused on outcomes; they do not describe the professional themselves (i.e. their attitudes or attributes), but rather the professional's abilities, knowledge, skills and behaviour.

## 7. PLG considerations

- 7.1 The PLG is invited to consider the Executive's recommendations in section 6 above. In addition, the PLG may wish to consider the following as part of their discussion on this topic:
- Does the PLG have any further thoughts, reflections or comments on the topic of values in education or values-based recruitment in relation to the SETs?
- 7.2 Issues raised by stakeholders about the role of values in education, including the recruitment of students, should be considered in light of the key principles behind development and use of the standards. In particular, the SETs should:
- be set at the **threshold** level, to ensure that education and training programmes provide students with skills and understanding to practise safely and effectively and to meet the standards of proficiency for their profession;
  - be **flexible**, in that we aim to minimise prescription and to enable education providers to meet the standards in the way they consider most effective and appropriate (given institutional and professional considerations);
  - be **meaningful**, clear and useful to education providers and other stakeholders; and
  - reflect **existing provision** within education and training programmes, or be realistic or reasonable as requirements.

## Appendix 1: Values in education – Other regulatory standards

Regulator	Current approach
<p>General Medical Council (GMC)</p>	<p>The GMC recently published ‘Promoting excellence: standards for medical education and training’, which will replace the current education standards in ‘Tomorrow’s Doctors’ from January 2016. They do not make any specific mention of recruiting medical students for values, but there are other references to values and related topics. The introductory sections state that a learner’s ability to develop the appropriate professional values is influenced by the learning environment and culture in which they are educated and trained. Standard S1.1 states that the educational culture must be caring and compassionate; and S1.2 states that the learning environment and organisational culture must enable learners to demonstrate what is expected in ‘Good medical practice’ (including professional values such as openness and honesty).</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.gmc-uk.org/Promoting_excellence_standards_for_medical_education_and_training_0715.pdf">http://www.gmc-uk.org/Promoting_excellence_standards_for_medical_education_and_training_0715.pdf</a> 61939165.pdf</p> <p>The GMC, alongside the Medical Schools Council (MSC), has also produced a guidance document ‘Medical students: professional values and fitness to practise’. This guidance emphasises behaviours such as non-discrimination, respecting patients, honesty and behaving with courtesy. Medical schools should make sure admissions information, student handbooks and information about rules or regulations, as well as fitness to practise information, include statements about the responsibility of medical students to develop professional values.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.gmc-uk.org/Medical_students_professional_values_and_fitness_to_practise_1114.pdf">http://www.gmc-uk.org/Medical_students_professional_values_and_fitness_to_practise_1114.pdf</a> 48905163.pdf</p>
<p>Nursing and Midwifery Council (NMC)</p>	<p>The NMC’s Standards for pre-registration nursing education are split into standards for competence and standards for education. Domain 1 of the standards for competence is ‘Professional values’ and states that all nurses must act first and foremost to care for and safeguard the public, be responsible and accountable for compassionate, person-centred nursing that respects and maintains dignity and human rights. Additionally all nurses must practise in a ‘holistic, non-judgmental, caring and sensitive manner that</p>

	<p>avoids assumptions, supports social inclusion; recognises and respects individual choice; and acknowledges diversity'. Domain 2 'Communication and interpersonal skills' states that nurses must be aware of their own values and beliefs and the impact this may have on their communication with others. The standards of education do not mention values-based recruitment but do require education providers to check that applicants are of good character (though the focus is on criminal convictions and cautions). In addition, reference to The Code is made a number of times in the standards.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.nmc.org.uk/standards/additional-standards/standards-for-pre-registration-nursing-education/">http://www.nmc.org.uk/standards/additional-standards/standards-for-pre-registration-nursing-education/</a></p> <p>The NMC produces separate Standards for pre-registration midwifery education. The document includes Essential Skills Clusters (ESC) which set out what student midwives must be able to demonstrate at the first progression point and at qualification. Under communication: '5. Treat women with dignity and respect them as individuals.' This includes acting professionally to ensure that personal judgements, prejudices, values, attitudes and beliefs do not compromise the care provided. Also under communication: '7. Provide care that is delivered in a warm, sensitive and compassionate way.' Again, there is no specific mention of values-based recruitment, though processes must be in place for checking applicants are of 'good character'.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.nmc.org.uk/standards/additional-standards/standards-for-pre-registration-midwifery-education/">http://www.nmc.org.uk/standards/additional-standards/standards-for-pre-registration-midwifery-education/</a></p>
General Dental Council (GDC)	<p>The GDC has recently updated its Standards for education (May 2015). There is no specific mention of personal or professional values in the standards.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.gdc-uk.org/Aboutus/education/Documents/Standards%20for%20Education%20(v2%20revised%202015).pdf">http://www.gdc-uk.org/Aboutus/education/Documents/Standards%20for%20Education%20(v2%20revised%202015).pdf</a></p>
General Osteopathic Council (GOsC)	<p>The Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) has developed a subject benchmark statement for osteopathy training in conjunction with the GOsC and the osteopathy training providers. There is no specific mention of values in this document. However there is reference to the 'longstanding osteopathic healthcare principles', which include emphasis on the patient (as a whole) rather than their disease or disorder; individually tailored interventions; and close collaboration between the osteopath and patient. Under knowledge, understanding and skills, the benchmark statement says that an osteopathic graduate will be able to</p>

	<p>demonstrate qualities of a caring, empathetic, patient-focused practitioner.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.gaa.ac.uk/en/Publications/Documents/SBS-consultation-osteopathy.pdf">http://www.gaa.ac.uk/en/Publications/Documents/SBS-consultation-osteopathy.pdf</a></p>
General Chiropractic Council (GCC)	<p>The GCC Degree Recognition Criteria do not include specific mention of personal or professional values. There are, however, some references to the GCC's Code of Practice and Standard of Proficiency, including principles such as respecting dignity, individuality and privacy.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.gcc-uk.org/UserFiles/Docs/DegreeRecCriteriaUPDATED2012.pdf">http://www.gcc-uk.org/UserFiles/Docs/DegreeRecCriteriaUPDATED2012.pdf</a></p>
General Optical Council (GOC)	<p>The GOC sets the necessary competencies which education and training must enable students to meet. This includes aspects of professional conduct, of which an indicator is 'respects and cares for all patients and their carers in a caring, patient, sensitive and appropriate manner'. The GOC does not produce a set of standards for education and training similar to the SETs, but rather a series of handbooks with guidelines for the approval of training establishments. The handbook for ophthalmic dispensing programmes links the core competency of professional conduct directly to learning outcomes.</p> <p>See: <a href="https://www.optical.org/en/Education/core-competencies--core-curricula/index.cfm">https://www.optical.org/en/Education/core-competencies--core-curricula/index.cfm</a></p>
General Pharmaceutical Council (GPhC)	<p>The document 'Future Pharmacists' sets out requirements against which the GPhC approve education and training for student pharmacists and pre-registration trainee pharmacists. Under Standard 1 – Patient and public safety, criterion 1.1 states: 'There must be effective systems in place to ensure that students and trainees...understand what is and what is not professional behaviour'. Learning outcomes also reflect the GPhC's ethical standards. 'Attitudes and values' as learning outcomes are likewise linked to the GPhC's Code of conduct for pharmacy students and Standards of conduct, ethics and performance. There is no mention of values-based recruitment, although the standards do require checks of good character, including criminal conviction checks.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.pharmacyregulation.org/sites/default/files/GPhC_Future_Pharmacists.pdf">http://www.pharmacyregulation.org/sites/default/files/GPhC_Future_Pharmacists.pdf</a></p> <p>The 'Standards for the initial education and training of pharmacy technicians' criterion 1.6 requires that training providers 'ensure that professionalism is embedded in trainees and to act as a guide to what constitutes acceptable</p>



<p>Scottish Social Care Council (SSSC)</p>	<p>inequality; and integrate the values of social work into own practice while understanding own personal value system.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.niscc.info/index.php/education-for-our-training-providers/regulating-training-standards-education">http://www.niscc.info/index.php/education-for-our-training-providers/regulating-training-standards-education</a></p> <p>The SSSC's Framework for Social Work education in Scotland encompasses the Scottish Requirements for Social Work Training and the Standards in Social Work Education (SiSWE), which set out learning requirements and proficiencies for social work education. The SiSWE link values to ethics and refer strongly to the Code of Practice for Social Service Workers. Students are expected to understand 'the nature, historical development and application of social work values and codes of practice' and to apply these social work values in practice. There is no requirement for values-based recruitment.</p> <p>See: <a href="http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2003/01/16202/17018">http://www.gov.scot/Publications/2003/01/16202/17018</a></p>
--	--